

Illegal Wildlife Trade (IWT) Challenge Fund Annual Report



IWT Challenge Fund Project Information

Project Reference	IWT 02
Project Title	Cutting Out the Middleman: Combatting Wildlife Trafficking in Vietnam
Country/ies	Vietnam (and Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations, and private businesses in Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya and South Africa).
Contract Holder Institution	Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS)
Partner institutions	Vietnam CITES Management Authority (CITES MA); National Environmental Police (Southern Office)
IWT Grant Value	£279,708
Start/end dates of project	1 April 2014 – 31 March 2017
Reporting period and number	April 2015 - March 2016, Annual Report 2
Project leader name	Scott Roberton
Project website	n/a
Report author(s) and date	Scott Roberton, April 30, 2016

1. Project Rationale

Organized Vietnamese crime syndicates have extended their wildlife trade networks around the world; Vietnam was singled out at CITES CoP16 as a primary driver in the African rhino crisis and a key transit country for illegal ivory leaving Africa en route to China. Vietnamese criminals coordinating this illicit trade are met with weak enforcement from national agencies that receive relatively little investment and support from state or overseas sources. These agencies lack the skills or political support to mount an effective response. Conservation issues - particularly involving wildlife not native to Vietnam - do not receive the attention, expertise and funds required. Increasing political support and improving law enforcement in consumer and transit countries, are critical components of demand-reduction strategies. Government action is an important driver for behavioral change and can lead to rapid, dramatic social change in contrast to social-marketing campaigns that change behavior through increased consumer awareness and eventually may lead to a sustained reduction in demand. A series of activities are being rolled out at the central level, with local field actions piloted in the major urban demand centre of the Ho Chi Minh (HCM) metropolitan region, and with Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading companies in four African countries where WCS is on-theground.

2. Project Partnerships

The Vietnam CITES MA is the Government of Vietnam's focal point on wildlife trade, the Standing Member of the Viet Nam Wildlife Enforcement Network (VN WEN) and is one of the main government partners on this project. They serve as official host of events/meetings and provide guidance and support to implementation of all project activities. In addition to the signed three-year cooperation agreement that outlines the working relationship between WCS and the CITES MA, an annual workplan has been updated and signed by the two agencies upon the arrival of the new Viet Nam CITES MA director in July 2015. To mitigate a delay in activity implementation due to understaffing, WCS has been supporting an additional staff member housed in the office

of CITES MA since June 2015. This additional staff member has facilitated communication and improved the relationship between the two agencies.

The National Environmental Police Department (EP) is the lead enforcement agency within the Ministry of Public Security (MPS) and is responsible for investigating and processing prosecutions of wildlife crimes. Their Southern representative office (C49B) is a key partner in this project for investigation and crackdown activities in the HCMC region.

During this second year of the project, WCS developed new partnerships with a diverse set of prosecution and judiciary institutions in Vietnam including People's Police Academy, Department of Criminal and Administrative Legislation of the Ministry of Justice, Supreme People's Procuracy, Ho Chi Minh City People's Procuracy and People's Court. These new partners have been directly involved in our project activities, particularly in capacity building and developing training materials on collection, analysis and dissemination of information/intelligence and new relevant articles in the Revised Penal Code of 2015 related to wildlife crimes.

3. Project Progress

3.1 Progress in carrying out project activities

Output 1: Vietnamese journalists and local civil society groups are informed and supportive of international wildlife trade issues.

During the second year of the project, WCS have continued our daily Wildlife Trade News Scan for our established and expanded network of over 200 journalists, NGOs, volunteers, local civil society groups and international agencies. In addition, we produced press releases for project events and shared to our network and followed up with tracking media coverage.

On the occasion of Sir Richard Branson's visit to Viet Nam, WCS coordinated media coverage, where we secured a placement for an Op Ed that we penned on Lao Dong newspaper, one of Vietnam's leading newspapers and had it syndicated on five other popular online news platforms in Vietnam and posted on a number of key opinion leaders Facebook pages with total 3665 "likes". We facilitated interviews for the main TV news broadcast. The footage was also used as part of a broader program on wildlife trafficking. We also arranged a leading environmental writer/blogger to interview Richard Branson and a story was published the following weekend with 70,000 printed copies.

Reviewing the role of CSOs in monitoring online illegal wildlife trade, WCS collaborated with the HCMC-based Action for Wildlife Organization (AWO) to organize a workshop on volunteer networks to monitor online wildlife trafficking on November 22, 2015 in Ho Chi Minh City. There were nearly 30 leaders and key members of NGOs and volunteer groups (such as GreenViet, Live & Learn) who committed to encouraging their group members to report online crimes to law enforcement agencies (LEAs). A talk-show session was facilitated by the Department for High-Tech Crime Prevention Police – Southern Office (C50B) and Sub-Department of Forest Protection to discuss in detail the wildlife reporting protocols, the difficulties described by all participants, and the way forward to collaborate on monitoring and reporting internet wildlife crimes.

Output 2. Local civil society and LEAs identify and begin to address the priority barriers to the prosecution and punishment of transnational wildlife trafficking cases and the key actions required to address these issues.

In collaboration with UNODC, a series of national working group reports and a final draft of the ICCWC Toolkit analysis were disseminated to relevant Government agencies in September 2015. These reports identified the key barriers faced by wildlife law enforcement in Vietnam. The CITES MA, with technical support from WCS, has also developed a National Program to control illegal trade in wild fauna and flora that incorporated a number of findings from these reports. This National Program has been reviewed and revised by VN WEN members. It is now under review for approval by Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and Government Office.

WCS and the CITES MA worked with the National Assembly (NA) to organize a series of consultation meetings to solicit comments on the Penal Code and Criminal Procedures Code to strengthen the draft article. The revised codes were ratified by the NA in November and will come into effect in July 2016. The revised Articles No. 234 and 244 concerning wildlife crimes are expected to address the vast majority of legal deficiencies that existed within the current penal code and enable a greater number of prosecutions and convictions. The revised Penal Code underlines that the Government of Viet Nam is now considering wildlife crime with a far greater profile. Compared to the maximum punishments specified in Article 190 on wildlife crime in the contemporary Penal Code of 1999, the maximum punishment for such crime is now three times higher in terms of monetary fines and more than double in terms of prison sentences. One major deficiency of Article 190 was the limited scope to cover only the "list of endangered, rare and precious species prioritized for protection" annexed to Decree No. 160/2013/NDCP; violations against other wildlife (even those of the CITES appendixes such as African elephants or African rhinos) were free from criminal liability. This led to traffickers of African elephant ivory and rhino horns escaping justice and cases not proceeding further than a prosecution or being subject to only a lenient sanctions. This deficiency is now tackled by the Penal Code of 2015, as the scope of the Code is extended to any official wildlife protection lists available within the Vietnamese legal system. It is now harder for cross-border traffickers to find excuses to avoid criminal liability. The updates in the ratified Penal Code of 2015 will be a steady ground for stricter law enforcement actions by the procuracies and courts in Vietnam.

In order to accelerate and maximise the impact of the Penal code revisions when they become active in July, WCS supported the Department of Administrative and Criminal Legislation, of the Ministry of Justice (MOJ) to develop training materials, to guide law enforcement officers from key provinces and national-level agencies on implementation of the revisions in the new Penal Code relating to wildlife trafficking. In March 2016 we supported a training program in Hai Phong City for 85 law enforcement officers (policemen, forest rangers, prosecutors, anti-smuggling customs officers and judges) from Hanoi, Quang Ninh, Hai Phong, Lang Son, Lao Cai and Hai Duong provinces. Participants were guided through a series of case studies and Q&A sessions to better understand the new articles. This support has enabled MOJ to now scale up this effort and they will conduct a similar workshop for provinces in Southern Viet Nam with leverages resources from USAID.

Output 3. Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in and relating to key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states are informed of the risks, punishments and scaled up law enforcement efforts and political commitment to tackling this in both Africa and Asia

In May 2015, with facilitation from Viet Nam embassies in Mozambique and Tanzania and support from the CITES MA, WCS organised a 10-day mission for key Viet Nam law enforcement and regulatory agencies of VN WEN, namely police, prosecutors, customs, forest rangers, and CITES MA, to meet their counterparts in the ivory and rhino horn range states including Kenya, Tanzania, Mozambique and South Africa.

The trip was coordinated in partnership with Vietnam embassies in Tanzania, Mozambique and South African and the Department of West Asia and Africa of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The mission consisted of a series of meetings and events with government agencies, embassies, international organizations, business and Vietnamese community members to increase bilateral enforcement cooperation against illegal wildlife trade between Vietnam and these range states. These landmark meetings produced a promising agenda for future enforcement cooperation, including deployment of a Vietnamese police liaison officer to Mozambique and developing a mutual legal assistance treaty (MLAT) between Vietnam and Mozambique. New cooperation opportunities with the embassies of Vietnam in Tanzania, Mozambique and South Africa were also identified during the trip. Furthermore, counterpart African agencies were invited to the multi-lateral dialogue meetings in Viet Nam.

A new partnership was also built with Viettel Corporation in Tanzania and Mozambique for future implementation of crime prevention outreach campaigns for the Vietnamese community in Africa. Around 50 posters and information, education and communications (IEC) materials were given

to raise awareness for Viettel staff in Tanzania. In Mozambique, over 50 Vietnamese attended the special outreach event. WCS sent four videos, 50 posters, 34 leaflets and 70 story booklets about rhino horn trafficking and wildlife protection to the Vietnam Embassy in Mozambique for raising awareness.

The multilateral dialogue meetings launched a new level of cooperation between Vietnam and key African rhino and elephant range states. Senior officers from customs, police agencies and prosecutors of Vietnam and African countries directly talked, and exchanged opinions and experiences for future cooperation actions. Furthermore, WCS facilitated diplomatic cooperation inviting Ambassadors and Embassy representatives from Vietnam Embassy to Tanzania and Mozambique, British Embassy in Hanoi, and Mozambique Embassy to Vietnam to participate in the dialogue meeting and join efforts to combat wildlife trafficking through diplomatic channels.

Output 4. Formal and informal inter-agency forums are functioning and the relevant LEAs are regularly sharing information through briefings and cooperating on planning and developing strategies to tackle rhino horn, elephant ivory and big cat trafficking crimes.

WCS supported CITES MA to organize two VN WEN meetings in Ha Noi and in Ho Chi Minh City in April and July 2015 respectively. In the April VN WEN meeting, discussion focused on the implementation of Prime Minister's Directive No. 03/CT-TTg on strengthening measures for controlling and protecting endangered, rare and precious wildlife, comments on the proposal for the centralization and inventory of all CITES App I seized products (notably, elephant ivory, rhino horn, and tiger skins), recommendations for international cooperation between Vietnam and African countries for combatting illegal wildlife trade, and problems in wildlife crime monitoring indicators in Vietnam. At the VN WEN meeting in July 2015, the VN WEN member agencies provided comments on the National Program to combat wildlife trafficking and developed an implementation plan for VN WEN for the period July 2015 to June 2016 as well as a revised VN WEN structure and ToR. This included adding the Supreme People's Procuracy and Supreme Court as a VN WEN agency.

A field mission was organized on July 23, 2015 for representatives from the Viet Nam CITES MA, National Customs Anti-smuggling Unit and Regional III Forest Protection Department, Agricultural Security Department to Moc Bai border gate, Tay Ninh province – a major trafficking choke-point on the Viet Nam-Cambodia land border. The delegation had a formal meeting with the Director of Moc Bai Customs Sub-Department to understand the Customs' border control operation and to confirm the information on a 9.4 kg rhino horn trafficked and seized in the same month of July 2015 by the Border Army in Moc Bai. The inter-agency delegation also visited Cu Chi Wildlife Rescue Station to see the rescued wildlife species and understand challenges faced after confiscation and the difficulties of released animals back into the wild.

Following the July VN WEN meeting the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development issued Decision No. 1026/QĐ-BNN-TCLN (March 31, 2016) outlining the revised VN WEN operating regulations and detailing responsibilities of each VN WEN member. This includes a call for all members to report wildlife trafficking cases on 20th day of the last month of each quarter to CITES MA Vietnam.

Output 5. Frontline police, customs, forest rangers and prosecutors start utilising intelligence analysis software and applying professional investigative techniques to gather and manage information on wildlife crimes



In collaboration with Forest Protection Department Zone III, WCS leveraged further support from USFWS to conduct a training course for law enforcement officers from Southern Viet Nam in August 2015 in Lam Dong province. Participants were from provincial departments of forest protection, economical police, environmental police, customs and border army from Binh Phuoc and Dak Nong provinces. The training focused on three main topics: legislation system, wildlife identification, and investigation methods and crackdown planning. Trainers also applied active learning methodologies to help participants understand well and suitably apply the legal framework into solving wildlife violations with their daily work.



On 29-30 May 2015, WCS collaborated with HCMC People's Procuracy to organize a workshop on improving the handling of wildlife crimes with attendance by 32 key representatives from procuracy, court, police and forest protection from HCMC. The workshop clarified concerns on legal frameworks and called for greater inter-agency collaboration during investigation, prosecution, and conviction based on Vietnam law against wildlife crimes, especially rhino horn and ivory cases. The participants were provided with basic information and had a chance to share their experiences with issues relating to wildlife trafficking, including international and domestic regulations and difficulties arising during law enforcement. Through presentations as well as open discussions, the workshop enhanced the concept of cooperation between LEAs working on wildlife protection related issues from different perspectives. One key to success for increasing the handling of wildlife crimes is the long-term multi-agency collaboration during investigation, prosecution and judgement, which were thoroughly discussed in the training as well.

On 24-25 March 2016, in collaboration with HCMC People's Court, WCS organized a two-day training course on legal framework for wildlife protection in Viet Nam in Phu Quoc district, Kien Giang province. Fifteen judges including officers and managers from Ho Chi Minh city People's Court and 13 judges from key HCM districts attended the course. The training covered different topics ranging from CITES implementation in Vietnam and wildlife crime prevention effort; the relevant laws and legal documents on management and protection of wildlife highlighting updates in the Penal Code of 2015; species identification of commonly trafficked wildlife for law enforcement. Open discussion with moot case analysis was used in order to help the participants obtain practical knowledge on how to judge a violation. This training also paved the way for collaboration opportunity between WCS and HCM People's Court on wildlife crime prevention activity in the future.

3.2 Progress towards project outputs

Output 1. Vietnamese journalists and local civil society groups are informed and supportive of international wildlife trade issues.

During this reporting period, our media tracking collated 759 articles covering illegal wildlife trade (double the articles scanned in the same period last year at 373 articles), especially the seizures and prosecutions of crime cases in the local and international online media. 551 articles showed positive views (supportive to enforcement efforts) (72.6%); 36 (4.74%) articles provided neutral views; 145 (19.1%) had no clear views; and 27 showed negative views accounting for 3.5%. The stable increase in the number of articles represents increasing interest by journalists in wildlife conservation issues. Their positive views also showed that they have a better understanding of the issues and changed their writing tone against illegal trade and consumption of wildlife products.

In regards establishing a protocol for reporting online wildlife crimes in HCMC, in this year we have successfully convened the leading local CSOs and volunteer groups alongside the relevant enforcement agencies and mapped out a protocol for implementation in the coming year. We have also started working with Internet service providers and social media companies to seek their support in developing plug-ins and Apps to support the monitoring protocol.

Output 2. Local civil society and LEAs identify and begin to address the priority barriers to the prosecution and punishment of transnational wildlife trafficking cases and the key actions required to address these issues

Priority barriers were identified through a participatory VN WEN led process that involved applying the ICCWC analytical framework for national responses to wildlife and forest crimes. The final report has been endorsed by VN-WEN and built into a new National Program to control illegal trade in wild fauna and flora by 2020 that has been submitted for government approval. Once approved this will be circulated to policy-makers in Government, Communist Party, and the foreign diplomatic sector.

Output 3. Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in and relating to key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states are informed of the risks, punishments and scaled up law enforcement efforts and political commitment to tackling this in both Africa and Asia

WCS is collaborating with the Vietnamese embassies that cover Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya and South Africa, both Vietnamese community associations in Tanzania and Mozambique, and the largest Vietnamese enterprise (VietTel) operating in Africa. In Mozambique we held a meeting for 50 of the 300 Vietnamese workers living in Mozambique and the full management board (10 people) of VietTel Tanzania. All Vietnamese ambassadors and embassy staff have been actively involved in project activities and assisted in convening events for overseas Vietnamese communities and companies. Furthermore, we have received further requests for support and technical inputs from the embassies and VietTel Management board for IEC materials and events to strengthen crime prevention amongst the Vietnamese community in Africa.

Output 4. Formal and informal inter-agency forums are functioning and the relevant LEAs are regularly sharing information through briefings and cooperating on planning and developing strategies to tackle rhino horn, elephant ivory and big cat trafficking crimes

The VN WEN meetings have been attended by all member agencies with representations at the senior level for the July meeting and for all have involved local level officers to ensure discussion are grounded in reality. At the April 2015 meeting, for the first time the Environmental Police cochaired the meeting, a clear signal of the growing functionality of the network. In this year, VN WEN members carried out a joint-agency field mission to the Vietnam-Cambodia border, authored a joint report on the results of the ICCWC toolkit and developed a new National Program to combat wildlife trafficking that was submitted to government.

Output 5. Frontline police, customs, forest rangers and prosecutors start utilising intelligence analysis software and applying professional investigative techniques to gather and manage information on wildlife crimes



Professional wildlife crime law enforcement techniques were provided to 145 frontline officers in the HCMC Metropolitan Area through field-based training and in partnership with the Centre for Criminology Research and Criminal Investigation of the People's Police Academy.

3.3 Progress towards the project Outcome

Our first outcome indicator is the percentage of arrests leading to conviction in court for offences relating to trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory where we expect to see an increase from the 2009-2012 baseline of 2% (44 arrests leading to one jail sentence) to 50% over the 3-year project period. The revisions to the Penal Code that come into effect in July 2016 provide the legislative framework for enhancing the proportion of convictions from arrests. We will be working with prosecutors and judges at the national and local level to ensure this legislative chance leads to the desired improved judicial impact.



Our final indicator is related to how the CITES Standing Committee and Rhino working group judge Viet Nam's progress on implementation and compliance with the CITES CoP16 Decisions. In the Standing Committee held in January 2016 in Geneva, CITES MA Vietnam sent a report on Vietnam's efforts to promote law enforcement cooperation between Vietnam and African countries, and on results of their demand deduction campaigns to combat wildlife trafficking, especially rhino horn and elephant ivory. The report was highly appreciated by the CITES standing committee and was recommended for reference by other delegations. Viet Nam will host the third international conference on Illegal Wildlife Trade in Ha Noi in November 2016 with an ivory destruction event prior to the meeting to show our commitment and high attention to wildlife trade in the country.

3.4 Monitoring of assumptions

Assumption	Analysis
Continued national commitment to CITES convention by Vietnam	Still holds true: Viet Nam continues to play an active role in CITES and commits resources to the CITES MA as the standing member of the VN WEN with 11 members from various LEAs including two new members of Supreme People's Procuracy and Supreme People's Court
WCS has established itself as a credible, loyal and trusted partner in a range of Vietnamese provinces and at a central level in the field of wildlife trafficking crimes and conservation and we cooperate with a range of agencies at both levels. To implement this project, this collaboration with individuals within local and central LEAs must continue.	Still holds true: WCS continues to collaborate extremely well with agencies at central and local levels. Starting this second year, we have expanded our partnerships at local level such as HCMC Supreme Court and also at central level with the Ministry of Justice, People's Police Academy and Supreme People's Court.
Increased media attention and involvement of central agencies (including Anti-corruption committees) will prompt the Vietnamese government to start	We are still considering this assumption. With the increasing media attention and the involvement of central agencies in wildlife crime prevention, we believe that the

addressing corruption of law enforcement officials in wildlife trafficking cases.	transparency in law enforcement will be improved but it takes time and strong actions to address the corruption among law enforcement officials in wildlife trafficking cases.
The Vietnamese media is controlled by a central government department that monitors and guides content and on certain topics has prevented coverage on certain topics/issues, where they consider them to be detrimental to social stability and the rule of law. We have access to the weekly minutes of the editors where this guidance is provided, and strong relationships with journalists to be aware if any of the stories/issues we are concerned with get blocked/prevented; but for the media to pressure criminal cases and cover key issues will require these issues to remain acceptable for communication by this department.	Still holds true: The Central Committee of Propaganda and Education continues to have significant influence over media orientation, and continues to support conservation stories and articles. We have been continuing to collaborate with them in different briefings and review meetings for editors-in-chief and journalists of key media in Vietnam.
Consensus can be reached on key actions required by the relevant stakeholders	We believe this still holds true: VN WEN is a good forum for the key stakeholders to reach consensus on key actions for wildlife crime prevention in Vietnam.
Vietnamese companies, associations and communities in or visiting key African range states are accessible and key ministries (Foreign Affairs, Industry & Trade) continue to collaborate with the CITES MA	Still holds true: The MoFA and relevant Vietnamese embassies have been very supportive to the activities proposed by WCS in Mozambique, Kenya, Tanzania, South Africa and Angola. WCS will build upon to have more specific activities with corporates and associations to reach more Vietnamese in the coming years.
VN WEN remains the key national-level forum for inter-ministerial planning and coordination on addressing international wildlife trade and all wildlife crime issues	This is still true: The organization, structure and operating mechanism of VN WEN have been consolidated in the recently issued Decision 1062/QD-BNN-TCLN dated March 31, 2016
WCS continues its strong collaboration with the National Environmental Police Department, Southern Office (C49B)	This is still correct as evidenced by the actions carried out together during the two years of the project. There has been changes in staff in the C49B and provincial environmental police departments of Ha Noi, Quang Ninh and others; however, WCS started to brief and involve these new officers in the monitoring and investigation of the trade network in their area. More to be updated in the next reporting cycle.

4. Impact: achievement of positive impact on illegal wildlife trade and poverty alleviation

This project continued building capacity through training programs and on-the-job support for government and judicial agencies and supported strengthening of the penal and criminal procedures code that will ultimately strengthen rule of law. The Project's collaboration with the Environmental Police has already resulted in more effective law enforcement that is destabilising criminal networks operating in Viet Nam.

5. Project support to the IWT Challenge Fund Objectives

The project has been making contribution to support two out three key objectives of the IWT Challenge Fund including ii. Strengthening law enforcement and the role of the criminal justice system; and iii. Reducing demand for the products of the illegal wildlife trade. In this second year of the project, WCS continued to enhance capacity for law enforcement officers including police, forest protection, customs, border army and others on investigation techniques, species identification and implementation of policies. We also made great efforts to support CITES MA and MOJ during the review and revision of the new articles related to wildlife crimes in the Penal Code of 2015.

Impact on species in focus

Similar to project activity implementation in year one, positive impacts to wild populations through reduced pressure from poaching is difficult to reliably quantify though is likely limited. The revised

penal code provisions provide a stronger legislative framework for all species protected under Vietnamese legislation and those species listed under CITES Appendix I and II and will provide greater deterrence to criminals.

7. Project support to poverty alleviation

In helping to reduce demand for illegal wildlife products and dismantle criminal networks, both of which drive poaching, we will be helping to mitigate the profound negative impacts associated with the illegal wildlife trade. The transnational criminal networks involved in this trade worsen socio-economic inequalities, provoke social conflict, undermine local governance throughout the trade chain, and pose threats to the livelihoods of people living in product source countries where tourism is a major industry. The communities directly reliant on tourism in these countries are often already susceptible to the effects of poverty and are disproportionately impacted by the tourism economy that often suffers as a result of poaching and other criminal activities. The project legacy will enhance the institutional capacity to tackle wildlife crimes and trafficking in Vietnam which can help reduce economic loss caused by the crimes in Vietnam and African range states.

8. Consideration of Gender equity issues

While directly improving gender equality is not a major focus of this project, we believe that our work may have indirect effects on women in several ways. In addressing many of the problems mentioned in the previous section, we will be helping to improve governance and rule of law in both Vietnam and product source countries. While not directly impacting women, this is often a first step in building more stable, equitable societies. Additionally, helping to reduce destabilizing threats to the tourism industry in African countries will undoubtedly help to improve the livelihoods of women. In Kenya and other countries that we have been working with, the tourism sector employs a higher number of women and young people than many other industries, and any threats to this industry will therefore disproportionately affect them.

9. Monitoring and evaluation

We have quarterly and yearly monitoring and evaluation plans in order to track the project's progress. Regular consultation and ad-hoc meetings with our key partners are also maintained for direct communication about project progress and joint planning for the following periods.

10. Lessons learnt

Understanding that CITES MA is a key partner for project implementation, and responding to the uncertainty experienced in Year 1, WCS formalised the partnership relationship with the Ministry developing an annual workplan outlining activities that was approved by the Vice-minister and thus empowered the CITES MA to prioritise support to this work. Moreover, we supported CITES MA by sending a staff person seconded to the CITES MA office to increase capacity. In addition, we have continued to diversify and widen our project partners to ensure timely implementation, this includes new partnerships with training institutions such as Police People's Academy, and others including Central Committee of Propaganda and Education, Ministry of Justice and HCMC Supreme Court.

11. Actions taken in response to previous reviews (if applicable)

Our partnerships with CITES MA Vietnam and C49B are maintained through various formal and informal consultations, meetings with leaders and staff of the agencies. WCS assumes the role of Technical Advisor to the Government, keeping 'behind the scenes' to empower our government counterparts. Progress on the work plan is evaluated in these regular meetings and debriefs are held after events/activities to assess implementation.

12. Other comments on progress not covered elsewhere

n/a

13. Sustainability and legacy

The Project is strengthening partnership with relevant government agencies and building capacity and commitment at the central political level to advocate positive changes in legislation, resource allocations and actions of local-level agencies that will have impact beyond the project period. We have been maintaining interest and commitment within government agencies as well as engaging local civil society to address the barriers to prosecution and punishment of transnational wildlife trafficking criminals. The revised Penal Code, ICCWC Toolkit report and Draft National Program is a significant achievement that the Project made substantial contributions towards and can be seen as a legacy of our work. Furthermore, the Project spend great efforts in year 1 and 2 to advocate for the inventory, sampling and destruction of Appendix I seized specimens – an activity that the CITES MA has proposed to take place this November on the side-lines of the Hanoi IWT Conference.

14. IWF Challenge Fund Identity

Promoting activities and efforts in that way would undermine the overall outcome of the project that is building national commitment and therefore as much as possible we frame activities as those of the CITES MA or other partner agencies so they are not seen as WCS-led or as part of an internationally-funded project. However, The IWT Challenge Fund and the UK Government have been acknowledged verbally as donors in all meetings/events by WCS and our co-host partners. Over the course of the second year, UKAid Logo has been used in all project's events.

15. Project Expenditure

Table 1 Project expenditure during the reporting period (April 2015-March 2016)

Project spend (indicative) since last annual report	2015/16 Grant	2015/16 Total actual	Variance %	Comments (please explain
Since last allitual report	(£)	IWT Costs	/0	significant
		(£)		variances)
Staff costs (see below)				
Consultancy costs				
Overhead Costs				
Travel and subsistence				
Operating Costs				
Capital items (see below)				
Others (see below)				
TOTAL				

Annex 1: Report of progress and achievements against Logical Framework for Financial Year 2015-2016

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Progress and Achievements: April 2015 - March 2016	Actions required/planned for next period
Impact The illegal trafficking in high-value wildlife species by Vietnamese communities, at home and abroad, does not threaten the survival of these species in the wild.		This project has built capacity and commitment within a number of key agencies of the Vietnamese government and criminal justice system that will lead to more effective enforcement of laws to combat wildlife trafficking networks; the revised penal code once active in July will provide a stronger increase the deterrence for criminal activities. This in turn will reduce threats to the survival of species in the wild across the region and in Africa	
Outcome Vietnam's government, criminal justice system, and civil society, has increased capacity and commitment to effectively enforce laws to disrupt and dismantle wildlife trafficking networks.	(i) The percentage of arrests leading to conviction in court for offences relating to trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory increases from the 2009-2012 baseline of 2% (44 arrests leading to one jail sentence) to 50% over the 3-year project period. (ii) By 2017, an intelligence-led approach has led to the identification and first ever arrest in Vietnam, of Vietnamese individuals coordinating a major transnational wildlife crime network. (iii) By 2017, Vietnam is judged by the CITES Standing Committee and Rhino working group, to have made significant progress on implementation and compliance with the CITES CoP16 Decisions	The revisions to the Penal Code that come into effect in July 2016 provide the legislative framework for enhancing the proportion of convictions from arrests. Furthermore, the revised VN-WEN reporting mechanism should provide the collation of data required to more accurately track conviction transfer ratios The Standing Committee held in January 2016 in Geneva, agreed that Viet Nam had made good progress towards meeting sits obligations to combat elephant ivory trafficking as laid out in Viet Nam's National Ivory Action Plan. The Standing Committee continues to require Viet Nam to report upon progress to meeting CoP16 decisions but the progress has been noted by the standing committee and was recommended for reference by other delegations.	Enforcement activated on a major rhino horn and elephant ivory trafficking network and individuals convicted under the new Penal code Provide more intelligence products of transnational wildlife crime networks for enforcement operation by LEAs in Vietnam. Support CITES MA Vietnam to attend The 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES (CoP17) in Johannesburg, South Africa.

Output 1. Vietnamese journalists and local civil society groups are informed and supportive of international wildlife trade issues.	1a. By 2017, on-going WCS media tracking records at least a 25% increase from 2013 levels (currently at 20%) in positive and supportive media coverage to the issues of rhino horn, elephant ivory, Asian big cat and freshwater turtle and tortoise trafficking and wildlife crime law enforcement in Vietnam 1b. By 2017, local civil society groups have established a protocol for reporting wildlife crimes to relevant agencies in the pilot site of HCM City Metropolitan Area and are regularly and systematically reporting wildlife crimes to the relevant agencies and individuals	trade (double the articles scanned in the same period last year at 373 articles), especial the seizures and prosecutions of crime cases in the local and international online media 551 articles showed positive views (supportive to enforcement efforts) (72.6%); 36 (4.7 articles provided neutral views; 145 (19.1%) had no clear views; and 27 showed negativiews accounting for 3.5%. We have successfully convened the leading local CSOs and volunteer groups alongside the relevant enforcement agencies and mapped out a protocol for implementation in the coming year. We have also started working with Internet service providers and social media companies to seek their support in developing plug-ins and Apps to support the monitoring protocol.	
Activity 1.1. Carry out daily online media track journalists to articles that are promoting interr	king and respond in comments and direct to national wildlife trade or consumption	Carried out daily media tracking, mining 759 domestic articles from online media and shared news reports on Vietnam's illegal wildlife trade, especially on the prosecutions of wildlife trade related crime to the increasing list of journalists and other CSOs on daily basis.	
Activity 1.2. Disseminate key reports, articles wildlife trade and wildlife crime enforcement to 150 local journalists of the major news service	o the WCS Vietnam media network of over	Continued sharing selected news, articles and press releases that highlight enforcement progress via WCS mailing lists and Facebook. We continue to assist local journalists in our network with science-based and evidence-based stories.	
Activity 1.3. Collaborate with local civil society Organisation) in HCM to develop and implem wildlife crimes (online and offline) to the relev	ent a pilot system for volunteers to report	Co-hosted with AWO a workshop on networks to monitor wildlife trafficking through the Internet for nearly 30 leaders/ key members of NGOs and volunteer groups on November 22, 2015 in Ho Chi Minh city. In next period, we will focus on the development and piloting of protocol in HCMC.	
Output 2. Local civil society and LEAs identify and begin to address the priority barriers to the prosecution and punishment of transnational wildlife trafficking cases and the key actions required to address these issues 2a. By the end of Year 2014 consensus is reached from Vietnam WEN, National Assembly Committees, and key local civil society stakeholders on priority barriers, and key actions required to address these issues. 2b. Policy paper endorsed and disseminated by CITES MA to policy-makers in Government, Communist Party, and the foreign diplomatic sector.		Priority barriers were identified through a participatory VN WEN led process that involved applying the ICCWC analytical framework for national responses to wildlife and forest crimes. The final report has been endorsed by VN-WEN and built into a new National Program to control illegal trade in wild fauna and flora by 2020 that has been submitted for government approval. Once approved this will be circulated to policy-makers in Government, Communist Party, and the foreign diplomatic sector	
Activity 2.1. Participatory exercise held at VN effective enforcement.	WEN meeting to identify and rank barriers to	N/A. Participatory exercises held in Year 1	
Activity 2.2. Study commissioned to collate existing data and prepare a briefing paper		N/A. Study completed in Year 1	
Activity 2.3. Briefing paper distributed for endorsement from VN WEN members		ICCWC Toolkit report and summary endorsed by VN-WEN and submitted to Government	
Activity 2.4. Briefing paper disseminated to key Government departments and other parties.		See 2.3 above	

Output 3. Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in and relating to key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states are informed of the risks, punishments and scaled up law enforcement efforts and political commitment to tackling this in both Africa and Asia	3. By the end of 2017, >50% of the Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in four key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states (Mozambique, Tanzania, Angola, and Kenya) have collaborated on project activities	WCS is collaborating with the Vietnamese embassies that cover Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya and South Africa, both Vietnamese community associations in Tanzania and Mozambique, and the largest Vietnamese enterprise (VietTel) operating in Africa. In Mozambique we held a meeting for 50 of the 300 Vietnamese workers living in Mozambique and the full management board (10 people) of VietTel Tanzania. All Vietnamese ambassadors and embassy staff have been actively involved in project activities and assisted in convening events for overseas Vietnamese communities and companies.
Activity 3.1. Official correspondence drafted a diplomatic missions, associations, and comparangola.		N/A completed in Year 1
Activity 3.2. Outreach evens held in cooperation with Vietnamese diplomatic missions, targeting associations, and companies in Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya, and Angola.		In May 2015, we organised a 10-day mission of key Viet Nam law enforcement and regulatory agencies to meet their counterparts in the ivory and rhino horn range states including Kenya, Tanzania, Mozambique and South Africa. WCS coordinated the trip in partnership with Vietnam embassies in those African countries. We will continue promoting the relations with those embassies for implementing other activities in the next period. In cooperation with Vietnamese diplomatic missions in Africa, we organized two outreach events for Vietnamese communities in Mozambique and Viettel staff in Tanzania. We also built a partnership with Viettel Corporation in Tanzania and Mozambique for future implementation of crime prevention outreach campaigns for Vietnamese communities in Africa.
Output 4. Formal and informal interagency forums are functioning and the relevant LEAs are regularly sharing information through briefings and cooperating on planning and developing strategies to tackle rhino horn, elephant ivory and big cat trafficking crimes	4a. VN WEN holds annual inter-agency coordination meetings and are attended by all member agencies, by relevant staff members (i.e. not junior staff as present) 4b. By 2017 VN WEN members have implemented at least three joint-field missions, authored at least three joint-reports on key wildlife crime issues, and held multi-agency briefings to communicate those.	The VN WEN meetings have been attended by all member agencies with representations at the senior level for the July meeting and have also involved local level officers to ensure discussion are grounded in reality. At the April 2015 meeting, for the first time the Environmental Police co-chaired the meeting, a clear signal of the growing functionality of the network. In this year, VN WEN members carried out the second joint-agency field mission to the Vietnam-Cambodia border, authored a joint report on the results of the ICCWC toolkit and developed a new National Program to combat wildlife trafficking that was submitted to government.
Activity 4.1. Annual VN WEN meeting of nation	onal LEAs on key topic/geographic area	The project supported the CITES MA to organize two VN WEN meetings in Ha Noi and in Ho Chi Minh City in April and July 2015 respectively.
Activity 4.2. Regular informal meetings of individuals from key LEAs on priority wildlife crime issues.		Ten consultation meetings with selected VN WEN members were held to discuss in more detail bi-lateral cooperation with Africa, reporting templates and stockpile destruction
Activity 4.3. Joint-agency field missions to 'hotspot' areas to gather information for briefings to VN WEN members		A joint field mission was organized in July 2015 for representatives from the Viet Nam CITES MA, National Customs Anti-smuggling Unit and Regional III Forest Protection Department, Agricultural Security Department to Moc Bai border gate, Tay Ninh province – a major trafficking choke-point on the Viet Nam-Cambodia land border.

Output 5. Frontline police, customs, forest rangers and prosecutors start utilising intelligence analysis software and applying professional investigative techniques to gather and manage information on wildlife crimes	5a. By 2017, based upon a two-year pilot deployment, there is central-level support, recommendations and a roadmap to the roll out of a professional intelligence analysis system to enable greater intelligence-led policing of wildlife crimes in Vietnam 5b. By 2016, the key units within the relevant agencies in the pilot site of the HCM City Metropolitan Area will have met basic proficiency in professional wildlife crime law enforcement techniques, be informed on national and international laws, and have tools to identify species and wildlife products	Professional wildlife crime law enforcement techniques were provided to 145 frontline officers in the HCMC Metropolitan Area through field-based training and in partnership with the Centre for Criminology Research and Criminal Investigation of the People's Police Academy.
Activity 5.1. Procurement, localisation, set-up analysis software within WCS and National E		
Activity 5.2. Annual training (classroom and on the job) of professional investigative techniques and new tools (e.g. GPS trackers) to gather intelligence to frontline law enforcement officers in HCM City Metropolitan Area		Professional wildlife crime law enforcement techniques were provided to 145 frontline officers in the HCMC Metropolitan Area. A practical exercise in gathering, managing and analysing intelligence of wildlife crimes developed by i2 was integrated into the training program co-organized by WCS and People's Police Academy in March 2016.
Activity 5.3. Joint-agency wildlife trade investigations in the HCM region, information gathered then inputted into the software		
Activity 5.4. Entry of data and archive information on HCMC wildlife crimes, production of intelligence charts, reports		All data and archive information on HCMC wildlife crimes has been inputted to i2
Activity 5.5. Implementation review and report to VN WEN Annual meeting in year 3		N/A
Activity 5.6. Annual procuracy and judiciary training programs in wildlife crime suppression		In May 2015, WCS and the HCMC People's Procuracy co-hosted a training workshop on improving the prosecution of wildlife crimes with attendance of 32 key representatives from procuracy, court, police and forest protection from HCMC. Additionally, in collaboration with HCMC People's Court, WCS organized a two-day training course on legal framework for wildlife protection in Viet Nam from 24 to 25 March 2016 for 28 judges of HCMC courts.

Annex 2 Logframe

Project summary	Measurable Indicators	Means of verification	Important Assumptions
Goal:			,
		ention on Biological Diversity (CBD), the Co MS), as well as related targets set by countr	
	<u> </u>	ties, at home and abroad, does not threate	•
Outcome:	1. The percentage of arrests leading to	1. Law enforcement agency (Police and	1. Continued national commitment to
Vietnam's government, criminal justice	conviction in court for offences relating	Prosecutors) reports to CITES MA	CITES convention by Vietnam
system, and civil society, has increased capacity and commitment to effectively enforce laws to disrupt and dismantle wildlife trafficking networks.	to trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory increases from the 2009-2012 baseline of c.2% (44 arrests leading to one jail sentence) to 50% over the three-year project period.	(made on request) on number of arrests, prosecutions and sentencing of wildlife cases	2. WCS has established itself as a credible, loyal and trusted partner in a range of Vietnamese provinces and a central level in the field of wildlife trafficking crimes and conservation as we cooperate with a range of agencies at both levels. To implement this project, this collaboration with individuals within local and central LE must continue
	2. By 2017, an intelligence-led approach has led to the identification and first ever arrest in Vietnam, of Vietnamese individuals coordinating a major transnational wildlife crime	2. Online media tracking	
	network. 3. By 2017, Vietnam is judged by the CITES Standing Committee and Rhino working group, to have made significant progress on implementation and compliance with the CITES CoP16 Decisions 3. Annual reports of LEAs (Customs Anti-smuggling Unit, Environmental Police, Procuracy) presented and shared at Annual Vietnam WEN meetings	Anti-smuggling Unit, Environmental Police, Procuracy) presented and shared at Annual Vietnam WEN	3. Increased media attention and involvement of central agencies (including Anti-corruption committees will prompt the Vietnamese government o start addressing corruption of law enforcement officials in wildlife trafficking cases
	4. By 2017, the CITES MA will have been granted additional resources (greater than inflation), in terms of both staff (2013:10 officers) and its state budget allocation (2013: \$ for core operating costs and staff) to address wildlife trafficking	4. CITES Standing Committee and rhino horn working group proceedings/minutes and decisions	

Outputs: 1. Vietnamese journalists and local civil society groups are informed and supportive of international wildlife trade issues.	1a. By 2017, on-going WCS media tracking records at least a 25% increase from 2013 levels (currently at 47%) in positive and supportive media coverage to the issues of rhino horn, elephant ivory, Asian big cat and freshwater turtle and tortoise trafficking and wildlife crime law enforcement in Vietnam 1b. By 2017, local civil society groups have established a protocol for reporting wildlife crimes to relevant agencies in the pilot site of HCM City Metropolitan Area and are regularly and systematically reporting wildlife crimes to the relevant agencies and individuals	1a. Online media reports 1b. Local civil society groups issue a joint-protocol for wildlife crime reporting, and publicise online	The Vietnamese media is controlled by a central government department that monitors and guides content and on certain topics has prevented coverage on certain topics/issues, where they consider them to be detrimental to social stability and the rule of law. We have access to the weekly minutes of the editors where this guidance is provided, and strong relationships with journalists to be aware if any of the stories/issues we are concerned with get blocked/prevented; but for the media to pressure criminal cases and cover key issues will require these issues to remain acceptable for communication by this department
2. Local civil society and LEAs identify and begin to address the priority barriers to the prosecution and punishment of transnational wildlife trafficking cases and the key actions required to address these issues.	2a. By the end of Year 2014 consensus is reached from Vietnam WEN, National Assembly Committees, and key local civil society stakeholders on priority barriers, and key actions required to address these issues.	2a. and 2b. Policy briefing paper, dissemination plan	Consensus can be reached on key actions required by the relevant stakeholders
	2b. Policy paper endorsed and disseminated by CITES MA to policy-makers in Government, Communist Party, and the foreign diplomatic sector.		
3. Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in and relating to key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states are informed of the risks, punishments and scaled up law enforcement efforts and political commitment to tackling this in both Africa and Asia	3. By the end of 2017, >50% of the Vietnamese diplomatic missions, migrant worker associations and trading and tourism companies in four key African ivory and rhino horn source/transit states (Mozambique, Tanzania, Angola, and Kenya) have collaborated on project activities	3. Proceedings from CITES MA/Embassy meetings showing number of Vietnamese associations and companies attending briefings and other events organised as part of the outreach campaign in Mozambique, Angola, Kenya and Tanzania	Vietnamese companies, associations and communities in or visiting key African range states are accessible and key ministries (Foreign Affairs, Industry & trade) continue to collaborate with the CITES MA

<u></u>		ex-	0
4. Formal and informal inter-agency forums are functioning and the relevant LEAs are regularly sharing information through briefings and cooperating on planning and developing strategies to tackle rhino horn, elephant ivory and big cat trafficking crimes	4a. VN WEN holds annual inter-agency coordination meetings and are attended by all member agencies, by relevant staff members (i.e. not junior staff as present) 4b. By 2017 VN WEN members have implemented at least three joint-field missions, authored at least three joint-reports on key wildlife crime issues, and held multi-agency briefings to communicate those.	4a. and 4b. VN WEN meeting minutes and proceedings	VN WEN remains the key national-level forum for inter-ministerial planning and coordination on addressing international wildlife trade and all wildlife crime issues
5. Frontline police, customs, forest rangers and prosecutors start utilising intelligence analysis software and applying professional investigative techniques to gather and manage information on wildlife crimes			WCS continues its strong collaboration with the National Environmental Police Southern Office

Activities (each activity is numbered according to the output that it will contribute towards, for example 1.1, 1.2 and 1.3 are contributing to Output 1)

- 1.1. Carry out daily online media tracking and respond in comments and direct to journalists to articles that are promoting international wildlife trade or consumption
- 1.2. Disseminate key reports, articles, events and happenings relating to illegal wildlife trade and wildlife crime enforcement to the WCS Vietnam media network of over 150 local journalists of the major news services/newspapers/online news providers
- 1.3. Collaborate with local civil society organisations (e.g. Action for Wildlife Organisation) in HCM to develop and implement a pilot system for volunteers to report wildlife crimes (online and offline) to the relevant agencies.
- 2.1. Participatory exercise held at VN WEN meeting to identify and rank barriers to effective enforcement

- 2.2. Study commissioned to collate existing data and prepare a briefing paper
- 2.3. Briefing paper distributed for endorsement from VN WEN members
- 2.4. Briefing paper disseminated to key Government departments and other parties
- 3.1. Official correspondence drafted and sent out from Hanoi to Vietnamese diplomatic missions, associations, and companies in Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya and Angola
- 3.2. Outreach events held in cooperation with Vietnamese diplomatic missions targeting associations, and companies in Mozambique, Tanzania, Kenya and Angola
- 4.1. Annual VN WEN meeting of national LEAs on key topic/geographic area
- 4.2. Regular informal meetings of individuals from key LEAs on priority wildlife crime issues
- 4.3. Joint-agency field missions to 'hotspot' areas to gather information for briefings to VN WEN members
- 5.1. Procurement, localisation, set-up and training of the professional intelligence analysis software within WCS and National Environmental Police Southern Office
- 5.2. Annual training (classroom and on the job) of professional investigative techniques and new tools (e.g. GPS trackers) to gather intelligence to frontline law enforcement officers in HCM City Metropolitan Area
- 5.5. Implementation review and report to VN WEN Annual meeting in year 3
- 5.6. Annual procuracy and judiciary training programs in wildlife crime suppression

Annex 3 Standard Measures

Checklist for submission

	Check
Is the report less than 10MB? If so, please email to <a href="https://www.lwt.number.n</td><td>YES</td></tr><tr><td>Is your report more than 10MB? If so, please discuss with <a href=" https:="" td="" www.number.numbe<=""><td>NO</td>	NO
Have you included means of verification? You need not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report.	YES
Do you have hard copies of material you want to submit with the report? If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number.	NO
Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors	YES
Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully?	YES
Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report.	